
Transformation of Islamic Education Curriculum Development Policy in the National Education System

Zailani^{a*}, Mursal Aziz^b

Abstract

The curriculum is an education device that is so essential in the learning process. It is because the curriculum is used as a reference in the school learning implementation. This research aims to describe the Islamic education curriculum transformation from time to time. This research is done by using the systematic literature review approach. The stages of this research are varied. They consist of planning the review, conducting the study, and reporting and dissemination. The data was taken from some documents such as books and articles from the national or international journal discussing the Islamic religious education curriculum and other curriculums in common. The data collected will then be analyzed by using the interactive analysis model. The result of this research shows that some Islamic religious education curriculum transformations in Indonesia happened several times. They make the changes to ensure that the implemented curriculum is suitable for recent era development. It hoped that people could use this result as an essential reference for other researchers to investigate the Islamic education curriculum in Indonesia.

Keywords: Curriculum, Islamic, education, national, system, transformation policy

1. Introduction

The struggle of Muslims to align Islamic education in Indonesia with general knowledge has long begun. They do several ways, such as by giving massive teaching of Arabic and forming the Muslim boarding school to remote areas (Wekke I. S., Arabic Teaching and Learning: A Model From Indonesian Muslim Minority, 2015). Nevertheless, the development of Islamic education in Indonesia has not shown the maximum result (Damopoli, 2007). A study by Sahlan (2014) for the example shows there is still a gap between teaching Islamic subjects and the time allocated. People take various approaches to improve the quality of Islamic education in Indonesia, starting from social, cultural to political strategies (Said, Umachandran, & Don, 2018).

Various new approaches in Islamic education in Indonesia have been carried out (Pasiska, 2019). Some of them are using a multicultural integration approach in teaching (Mumtahanah, 2020). The main idea of this integration is that teaching activities in Islamic schools do not separate themselves from students' world and environment (Wekke & Lubis, 2008). Another approach is to apply information technology as part of teaching, so students have a modern perspective (Wekke & Hamid, 2013). The application of technology in learning has a decisive role in both the pedagogical and religious aspects (Zedan, Yusoff, & Mohamed, 2015; Dalle et al., 2017; Baharuddin & Dalle, 2019).

People can make some approaches (Ali, 2017). Some Islamic education in Indonesia still does not have good quality. In contrast, Islamic culture is the main foundation and part of future investment, community investment, and state investment to advance and educate the nation's life (Wardi, 2014). More specifically, the role of Islamic education is critical in shaping and training young leaders (Abdulhamid, 2017). Islamic culture should also be able to answer the challenges brought by the

^a Department of Islamic Education, Universitas Muhammadiyah Sumatera Utara, Jl. Kapten Muchtar Basri No.3, Medan, Sumatera Utara 20238, Indonesia

^b Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Tarbiyah Al-Ittihadiyah Labuhanbatu Utara, Jl. Lintas Sumatera, Guntung Saga, Kualuh Sel., Kabupaten Labuhanbatu Utara, Sumatera Utara 21457

*E-mail correspondence: zailani@umsu.ac.id

modern world both on a theoretical and practical level (Ashaari et al., 2012). Therefore, the right strategy is needed to maximize the progress of Islamic education so that all levels of society benefit (Salleh, 2013). In particular, policies and special handling to help Islamic Education institutions, which can be represented by Islamic boarding schools, Madrasa, and Islamic schools, are needed (Efendi, 2008).

The development of the Islamic religious education curriculum requires a clear and solid foundation so that it is not easy to change due to the flow of transformation (Nurhadi, 2019). The Islamic education curriculum in Indonesia has undergone several developments and changes. The people implemented some development and changes in a curriculum. It is because the policy was considered essential for the future of Islamic education in Indonesia. The procedure taken is the result of a critical study in achieving the objectives of Islamic education in Indonesia. The transformation of Islamic education curriculum policy is closely related to the paradigm to improve the quality of Islamic culture in Indonesia following the conditions and developments of the times (Said, Muhammad, & Elangkovan, 2014). Besides, another point of this change is also referred to as Woodward (2015), which argues that change occurs because the government seeks more to instill Islamic values in students. Mainly, the curriculum has a role in shaping Islamic education graduates whose emphasis is on the character to provide personality development (Dacholfany, 2015). According to Eka (2017), the movement to strengthen role began in 2010, where character education was included in the national policy development roadmap for character education. This roadmap was then realized and listed in the latest curriculum, the 2013 curriculum as a guide to Islamic culture (Utaminingsih, Utomo, & Zamroni, 2017). In Islam, the focal point for character development is also known as "akhlaq" (Sutomo, 2014).

The policy transformation of the development of the Islamic education curriculum in Indonesia underwent several change processes following educational needs (Dhaifi, 2017). A study done by Ayuhana (2015) showed that in the course of history since Indonesia's independence, the national education curriculum has been transformed several times, including in 1947, 1952, 1964, 1968, 1975, 1984, 1984, 1994, and 2004, and then the 2006 curriculum. The latest curriculum is the 2013 curriculum or what is now called the national curriculum (Mawardi, 2016). It is not only at the primary school level but also in the university environment (Hanafi, 2019).

This curriculum policy transformation still raises the pros and cons of education practitioners because of its impact. Many discourses have developed related to the transformation of Islamic education curriculum policies. There are various perceptions, appreciations, and criticisms related to changes that occur in the applied curriculum. The critics of changes in the curriculum of Islamic education, according to Muhammedi (2016), are more caused by the unpreparedness to anticipate the challenges of globalization and the perspective of Islamic scholarship that is still oriented inward. Some others who appreciate the change in the curriculum are of the view that every turn in the syllabus must be able to answer and respond to the development of life in various fields (Ritonga, 2018). Besides, producing graduates of increasingly high quality is the estuary of changes in the existing curriculum (Hashim, 2017).

2. Method

This research is done by using the systematic literature review (SLR). The reason for choosing the SLR approach is to get empirical evidence that explains the transformation of the policy of developing the Islamic education curriculum in Indonesia's national education system, which is also the aim of this study. These objectives are in line with the SLR approach's intentions, which is to look for empirical evidence that meets specific criteria to solve research problems (Snyder, 2019). The SLR stages used in this research are: planning the review, conducting the study, and reporting and dissemination (Tranfield, Denyer, & Smart, 2003). Empirical data used in this article is taken from books and articles in national and international journals. The data analyzed descriptively and qualitatively by an interactive analysis model consisting of three stages. Those stages are data reduction, data display, conclusion drawing/and verification (Miles & Huberman, 2014).

3. Result

The Implementation of Islamic Education Curriculum Policy

Policies are government decisions that are general and generally apply to all members of the community (Abidin, 2006). The system is a set of goals, principles, and regulations that guide an organization; thus, it includes the overall direction of the organization. The policy is the result of top management decisions made with care in essence in the form of goals, principles, and rules that direct the organization (Syafaruddin, 2008). Besides, actors must implement policies to solve a particular problem (Ramdhani & Ramdhani, 2017).

Designing a policy must provide a pattern of activity directions for the possibility of a decision

(Vargas, Lawthom, Prowse, Randles, & Tzoulas, 2019). According to Schmidt (Schmidt, 2008), designing a policy cannot be instantaneous, as well as in the implementation process later. Some principles that must be considered in developing strategy are the complexity of a context, the usefulness, harmony between design and potential implementation, as well as the law of sustainability in its application (Newig & Koontz, 2014).

As mentioned above, policy-making and implementation are related to one another. In principle, the application of policies is a way for a system to achieve its goals (Khan, 2016). Public policy implementation can be in the form of laws, or regional regulations are a type of public policy that requires implementing regulations (Khan & Khandaker, 2016). Implementation of systems based on this understanding can be seen as a process of implementing policy decisions (usually in the form of laws, government regulations, judicial decisions, executive government, or presidential decrees) (Nugroho, 2009).

The policy implementation process is very decisive in achieving educational goals (Hog, Kleinschmit, & Rayner, 2016). This process is vital because of the end of all policies that have been taken in at the implementation stage. If the policy formulation has been made very well, but there is no follow-up in the form of implementing the formulated policy, it is a futile effort and no benefit (Hasbullah, 2015). In general, implementing a strategy is influenced by clear policy objectives, a leadership committed to carrying out the policy, and sufficient finances to support policy implementation (Salvesen, Evenson, Rodriguez, & Brown, 2008).

Individually, the implementation of education policy is also determined by many factors. Policy experts have diverse views regarding the factors that influence the success of policy implementation. Grindle states that the factors that must be considered in implementing policies are aspects of the content of the procedure itself (the content of administration), which will affect the social, economic, and political environment, as well as the context or context of implementation (context of application) implementation. Both of these aspects are understood by Grindle as factors that can influence the success of the policy implementation process. On the other hand, Tezera (2019) stated that several other factors determine the successful implementation of a policy, such as a practical approach, collaboration between actors, enthusiasm for implementing strategies, and field risk management.

Policy implementation is a way to implement a policy to be able to achieve predetermined goals.

Plans are also made so that performing objects can continuously adapt to changing situations (Marume, 2016). Procedure in the education sector is used to understand the policy itself, which is part of public policy (Solichin, 2015). Through the implementation of policies on developing the Islamic education curriculum, it is hoped that Islamic education institutions can effectively and efficiently achieve the objectives of Islamic education.

The Transformation of Islamic Education Curriculum

The word transformation means the change in form (form, nature, function, and so on). Meanwhile, the word curriculum in Arabic is called *Manhaj*, which means the bright path traveled by humans in various fields of life (Ramayulis, 1994). On the other hand, the curriculum is a plan or discussion of teaching so that educational activities' direction becomes bright and clear (Nata, 2010). According to the Oemar Hamalik curriculum is an educational program provided by educational institutions (schools) for students (Arifin, 2012). The curriculum as a whole system has components that are interrelated with one another, those are objectives; material; methods, and organization; evaluation (Halimah, 2011). Each component in the curriculum is interrelated, and even each is an integral part of the curriculum.

The curriculum in Islamic education, known as "*manhaj*," means a clear path through which educators and their students develop their knowledge, skills, and attitudes (A-Syaibany, 1984). From the perspective of the philosophy of Islamic education, an education curriculum is primarily a tool or instrument for educating learners in developing the potential of *jismiyah* and *ruhiyah* so that they can later identify and reinforce their primordial confession to Allah SWT (Al-Rasyidin, 2012).

The Islamic education curriculum also contains elements of the educational process and all educational programs that teachers and educational institutions follow and direct in their learning activities, especially instructing learners to achieve their desired Islamic educational goals (Syafaruddin, 2009). Based on these understandings, the curriculum's transformation is informational knowledge of the changing educational programs provided by educational institutions (schools) for learners.

The curriculum policy transformation was carried out because it was considered very important in adjusting education to the changing circumstances. According to Filho et al. (2018), the curriculum transformation process provides an opportunity for experts and educators to rethink the

implementation of existing learning. Indeed, curriculum transformation will always lead to where teachers are not yet familiar with system changes (BirutėŽygaitienė, Barkauskaitė, & Miškinienė, 2013). Sung, Chang, & Liu (2016) add that curriculum transformation is also done because it expects outcomes with a higher level of thinking. The change of a curriculum must also look at the world conditions, which consist of multiculturalism so that the curriculum needs to be adjusted further (Demir & Yurdakul, 2015).

Shafi'i Ma'arif concluded that there were three factors why a critical reform was carried out by Muslims. These three factors are that: a. the interpretation of something is impossible to reach the absolute truth, b. Islam aims to create political-reality actualizing the benefits of Islam for all nature, c. Companions of the Prophet provide creative examples of implementing reform (Asari, 2002). Based on this opinion, the curriculum development policy is a natural and common thing.

The factors causing the change of curriculum in Indonesia are as follows:

A. The Developed Intellectual View

The intellectual activity of the Muslim community advanced and developed along with the progress of civilization and the expansion of its territory. This is due to the Muslim scientific world. It has begun to tread the direction of the development of various scientific disciplines as tangible evidence of the depth of the studies conducted and the breadth of its scope (Asari, 2006).

B. The Existence of Industry and Technology Development

To reach all aims, education in the modernization process will experience the intra-system and functional change (Azra, 1999). One of them is the change of curriculum, which is caused by the fast technology development based on the curriculum of the work environment, which uses the technology (Ulu & Kiraz, 2014). Kristanto (2016) believes that preparing a reliable, professional workforce and capable of using technology concerning the world of work is a must. Therefore, the workforce must be educated and trained and master information. Professions that demand mastery of technology in the future are expected to develop rapidly (Ariani, 2017; Dalle & Mutalib, 2018; Derlina et al., 2018).

C. New Thought about Teaching Process

Syahrin Harahap writes that there are five contributions to the renewal of thought in Islam,

which at some level can be used as a starting point to see the significance for nation-building, one of which is the renewal of Islamic thinkers emphasizing the mastery of science and technology (Harahap, 2015). The development of science and technology certainly changes the social politics of a nation so that people's needs change and demands curriculum transformation to be able to answer these changes, so that curriculum changes occur. In line with this view, significant and dynamic changes in the mastery of science and technology make curriculum changes must follow the rhythm that has been formed. In fact, in the process, the transformation of a curriculum is not natural. It must pay attention to various aspects such as pedagogical aspects, learning, introductory methods, and made in a comprehensive document (Wahyuni, 2016).

D. Political Orientation and the State Practice

Education and politics are two essential elements in the socio-political system in every country, both developed and developing countries. Although culture and politics are positioned as two crucial elements in the socio-political system, they are often examined as separate parts—politics and education, to support and complement each other. Educational institutions and processes play an essential role in shaping society's political behavior so that it has a significant impact on the characteristics of education in a country. Politics and culture have a close and dynamic relationship where the relationship is an empirical reality that has occurred since the early development of human civilization and is of concern to scientists (Sirozi, 2010). In this case, empirical facts are often associated with the fact that political aspects play a significant role in making decisions about whether or not curriculum changes can be made (Kasuga, 2019).

The transformation of curriculum development policies occurs through curriculum changes. The Indonesian government's efforts to run the world of education in achieving the expected educational goals are to transform the education curriculum. The transformation is one step in developing the existing curriculum with previous curricula to achieve the objectives of Islamic education effectively and efficiently.

The transformations of curriculum policies that have been applied to Islamic educational institutions from time to time in various regions of Indonesia are as shown in Table 1 below.

Table 1. The transformations of curriculum policies that have been applied to Islamic educational institutions

No	Year	Name of Madrasa	The Curriculum Used
1	1909	Madrasah Diniyah (Adabiah School)	The learning system that grows and develops based on values and cultural characteristics, this multi-dimensional education system in Madrasa, namely religious knowledge, builds social awareness and human character as servants of God (Djumu, 1976).
2	1910	Madrasah Al-Munawwir located in the Krapyak Village, Yogyakarta	Department of Religion Plus curriculum: From this curriculum can be taken types of subjects, while the textbooks still use the Yellow Book. General science and religious knowledge cannot be separated absolutely (Subhan, 2012)
3	1914	Madrasah Thawalib Padang Panjang	Curriculum with the Ideal System: This curriculum is used to bring out new problems using new books. It learns about Nahwu, Sharaf, and Ushul Fiqh (Yunus, 1992).
4	1918	Makhtab Islamiyah Tapanuli	The curriculum in this period is when the changes happened quickly, and the debate about nationalism and understanding religion often occur (Steenbrink, 1986).
5	1920 and 1930	PesantrenTebuireng	The early teaching system used was the sorghum method (students read the yellow book material in front of the teacher), the weton or bandit, or the halqah method (they read the book, and the students gave meaning). Education reform is primarily about opening up a still-closed section of modernized education
6	1926	Madrasah Kuliyyatul Mu'allimin al- Islamiyyah (KMI)	The proportional balance between religious and general knowledge, and integration between extra-extracurricular, several fields, Arabic, Dirasah Islamiyah, teacher training and educational psychology, English. (Yasmadi, 2002)
7	1930	Madrasah Al-Jami'iyatul Washliyah di Medan	Islamic-based curriculum: Working on the laws of Islam. Multiply tablighs, studies, and meditations. The publishes books, newspapers, magazines help the poor and raise and educate orphans. They were delivering the call of Islam to non-Muslims. Advance and enjoy life in a halal way (Yunus, 1992).
8	1931	Madrasatul Arabiyatul Islamiyah	MMP and MMA curriculum: This curriculum is more prominent in religious studies, namely 60% religious studies and 40% general lessons. The general lessons given are Indonesian, English, economics, geography, mathematics, science (Subhan, 2012).
9	1949	Madrasah Islamiyah Lilbanat	According to Steenbrink, the education conducted at MIT is an addition to religious culture during the day for government school students. It is valid for students who study in the afternoon, but those studying in the morning study religion in particular. (Tanjung, 2012)
10	1957	Madrasah Sa'adatud Darain in Jambi	1958 Lesson Plans. This curriculum is a refinement of the 1950 Lesson Plans. This curriculum was used until 1964 (Suparlan, 2011).
11	1960	Darul Fallah Agriculture Islamic Boarding School	Using a curriculum that refers to the National Curriculum of the Department of Religion and the Department of National Education, which is enhanced with local content, especially the spirit of independence. More emphasis on functional aspects and a high level of relevance will be achieved between coaching during education with the needs of use in society (Widodo, 1974)
12	1964	Madrasah Diniyah Wushto	Traditional Quranic studies in the field of faith and morals (Suyoto, 1974)
13	1986	Madrasah Mathaliul Falah in Kajen, Central Java	1984 curriculum: This curriculum is a refinement of the 1975 curriculum. Therefore the 1984 curriculum is also known as the 1975 Improved curriculum. The 1984 curriculum applies based on the Minister of Education and Culture Decree No. 0461 / U / 1983 dated October 22, 1983, concerning Improvement of the Curriculum. Elementary and Secondary Education within the Ministry of Education and Culture. There are four aspects refined in this curriculum, namely: (1) implementing PSPB, (2) adjusting the curriculum program objectives and structure, (3) choosing necessary abilities and integration and harmony between the functional cognitive and psychomotor domains, (4) implementing lessons based on learning constraints that are tailored to the speed of learning of each student. (Suparlan, 2011)
14	1990	Madrasah Al-Munawwir	Applying the curriculum standard based on Islamic Boarding School traditional culture. Educational activities in the Al-Munawwir boarding school are memorizing the Al-Quran. The yellow book study was held as a complement to the study of the Al-Quran (Subhan, 2012)

Based on the description of the curriculum policies of Islamic educational transformation institutions above, it can be seen that the curriculum used by Islamic educational institutions has been creative since 1909 following the curriculum pattern at that time. Islamic education institutions have also increased significantly in the last few years (Srimulyani, 2013). The curriculum used by Islamic educational institutions is more directed to the community's needs and tends to prioritize religious lessons. Spiritual lessons are the main lessons that must be learned. The longer the curriculum in Madrasa began to open to receive general lessons combined with spiritual experiences.

The curriculums that have been applied in Indonesian Islamic educational institutions in the last fourteen years are as follows:

a. Competency-based Curriculum

A curriculum in 2004 was named the Competency-based Curriculum (CBC). Competency-based education focuses on developing the ability to perform (competency) specific tasks following established performance standards. Competency-based curriculum (CBC) can be interpreted as a curriculum concept that emphasizes developing the ability to perform (competency) tasks with specific performance standards so that students can feel the results. The result is in the form of mastery of a particular set of competencies. CBC is directed to develop students' knowledge, understanding, abilities, values, attitudes, and interests to do something in the form of skills, accuracy, and success with full responsibility (Mulyasa, 2006). In line with this view, Rifai (2012) emphasizing that basically, competence is more mentalist and socio-psychological than vocational, even though professional attitude is contained incompetence. Based on this thing, the competency-based curriculum changes to become a KTSP.

b. Education Unit Level Curriculum

In 2006 the curriculum applied was KTSP. This curriculum is an operational curriculum compiled by and implemented in each education unit (Muhaimin, 2009). KTSP consists of educational objectives at the education unit level, curriculum structure, and content at the education unit level, education calendar, and syllabus.

In general, the purpose of implementing KTSP is to empower and empower education units through the granting of authority (autonomy) to educational institutions and encouraging schools to make participatory decision making in curriculum development (Baedhowi, 2016). Furthermore, this curriculum demands changes in learning planning, realization, and evaluation through an effective and

efficient event car (Rokhman & Yuliati, 2010). The special-purpose why KTSP is used are as follows:

- 1) They are improving the quality of education through independence and school initiatives in developing curriculum, managing, and empowering available resources.
- 2) Increase the concern of school citizens and the community in developing the curriculum through joint decision making.
- 3) Increase healthy competition between education units about the quality of education to be achieved (Mulyasa, 2007).

c. 2013 Curriculum (K 13)

The 2013 curriculum is a competency-based curriculum initiated in the 2004 Competency-Based Curriculum (KBK). Still, it has not yet been completed because of the urge to immediately implement the 2006 Education Unit Level Curriculum (KTSP). This change could lead to pros and cons among practitioners considering the massive socialization carried out for Competency-Based Curriculum but seem very quickly changed in the interests of KTSP because it is no longer renewable (Mahfud, 2019). The formulation is based on a different perspective from the material-based curriculum, so it is possible for differences in perception about how the curriculum should be designed.

The 2013 Curriculum objectives also mentioned the formation of faithful people, namely, to prepare Indonesian people who can live as individuals and citizens who are reliable, productive, creative, innovative, and practical and able to contribute to society, nation, state, and world civilization. The 2013 curriculum also promotes a scientific approach for students to solve problems (Rahayu, 2016).

The 2013 curriculum is the latest curriculum that is expected to answer the needs of national education. This curriculum change is an effort to produce Indonesian human resources that can compete with this curriculum's proven characteristics. On the other hand, the implementation of the 2013 curriculum had caused problems. The contents of this curriculum seemed to be accelerated, and the materials were transformed compared to the previous syllabus (Yulianti, 2015)

Based on the description above, it can be seen that many curriculums have been applied in Islamic educational institutions in achieving the educational goals that exist in each educational institution from various regions.

4. Conclusion

The Transformation of Islamic education curriculum development policy is as needed by education. In history, the development of the Islamic

education curriculum in Indonesia has undergone several transformations. The policy transformation of the Islamic education curriculum development aims is to improve the quality of education in Indonesian Islamic education institutions by the times. The change of curriculum policy is inseparable from the pros and cons of influential education practitioners in making the following curriculum policy.

The transformation Policy for developing the Islamic education curriculum in Indonesia is according to educational needs. In history, since Indonesia's independence, the national education curriculum has been transformed several times. Among them are in 1947, 1952, 1964, 1968, 1975, 1984, 1994, and 2004, and then the 2006 curriculum. The latest curriculum at the moment is the 2013 curriculum or what is now called the national curriculum.

5. References:

- Abdulhamid, R. (2017). The Prospects of Islamic Education Curriculum: The Case of the University of Abuja. *Ta'dib: Journal of Islamic Education*, 22(1), 87-95. Retrieved from <http://jurnal.radenfatah.ac.id/index.php/tadib>
- Abidin, S. Z. (2006). *Public policy*. Jakarta: Suara Bebas.
- Ali, M. (2017). The flow of transformative Islamic education in Indonesia: An initial assessment. *SUHUF*, 29(1), 1-14.
- Al-Rasyidin. (2012). *Islamic education philosophy: Building on ontology, epistemology, and axiology frameworks for educational practices*. Bandung: Citapustaka Media Perintis.
- Ariani, D. (2017). The actualization of the education technology profession in Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal of Curriculum and Educational Technology Studies*, 5(1), 1-9. doi:10.15294/ijcets.v3i1.8675
- Arifin, Z. (2012). *Development of quality management in the Islamic education curriculum*. Jogjakarta: Diva Press.
- Asari, H. (2002). *Modernization of Islam: People, ideas, and movements*. Bandung: Citapustaka Media.
- Asari, H. (2006). *To uncover the history of looking for ibrah: A treatise on the social-intellectual history of classical Muslims*. Bandung: Citapustaka Media.
- Ashaari, M. F., Ismail, Z., Puteh, A., Samsudin, M. A., Ismail, M., Kawangit, R., . . . Ramzi, M. I. (2012). An assessment of teaching and learning methodology in Islamic studies. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 59, 618-626. doi:doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.09.322
- A-Syaibany, O. M.-T. (1984). *Islamic Education Philosophy*. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang.
- Ayuhana, M. M. (2015). The development of the Islamic elementary school curriculum in Indonesia (Analysis of objectives and curriculum teaching materials 1994, 2004, 2006, 2013). *Jurnal Tarbawi*, 12(2), 169-184.
- Azra, A. (1999). *Islamic Education: Tradition and modernization towards the new millennium*. Jakarta: Logos Wacana Ilmu.
- Baedhowi, B. (2016). Education unit level curriculum: Policy and expectations. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan*, 13(65), 171-181. doi:<https://doi.org/10.24832/jpnk.v13i65.323>
- Baharuddin., & Dalle, J. (2019). Transforming learning spaces for elementary school children with special needs. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 10(4), 344-365.
- BirutėŽygaitienė, Barkauskaitė, M., & Miškinienė, M. (2013). Professional competences of a teacher during the period of educational paradigm transformation in Lithuania. *Procedia- Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 83, 165-169. doi:doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.06.032
- Dacholfany, M. I. (2015). Islamic education reform in the face of globalization: A challenge and hope. *AKADEMIKA*, 20(1), 173-194.
- Dalle, J., & Mutalib, A. A. (2018). The impact of technologies in teaching interaction design. *Journal of Advanced Research in Dynamical and Control Systems*. 04(Special Issue), 1779-1783
- Dalle, J., Hadi, S., Baharuddin., & Hayati, N. (2017). The development of interactive multimedia learning pyramid and prism for junior high school using macromedia authorware. *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*. November (Special Issue for IETC 2017), 714-722
- Damopoli, M. (2007). A portrait of Islamic education: Perspectives on renewing thinking in contemporary Indonesian Islam. *Lentera Pendidikan*, 10(1), 52-67.
- Demir, N., & Yurdakul, B. (2015). The examination of the required multicultural education characteristics in curriculum design. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 174, 3651-3655. doi:doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.1085
- Derlina, Dalle, J., Hadi, S., Mutalib, A. A., & Sumantri, C. (2018). Signaling principles in interactive learning media through expert's walkthrough. *Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education*. 19(4), 147-162

- Dhaifi, A. (2017). Development of the Islamic Religious Education curriculum in Indonesia. *Edureliga*, 1(1), 76-88.
- Djumu. (1976). *Education history*. Bandung: CV Ilmu Bandung.
- Efendi, A. (2008). The strategic role of Islamic-based educational institutions in Indonesia. *El-Tarbawi*, 1(1), 1-11. doi:<https://doi.org/10.20885/tarbawi.vol1.iss1.art1>
- Eka. (2017). Revisiting character education from an Islamic perspective: A quest for character-based knowledge in Indonesia. *Journal of Islamic Studies*, 21(1), 1-32. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.20414/ujis.v21i1.1156>
- Filho, W. L., Raath, S., Lazzarini, B., Vargas, V., Souza, L., R.Anholon, . . . Orlovic, V. (2018). The role of transformation in learning and education for sustainability. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 199, 286-295. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.07.017>
- Halimah, S. (2011). *Curriculum Study*. Medan: Perdana Publishing.
- Hanafi, Y. (2019). The changing of the Islamic education curriculum paradigm in public universities. *Al-Ta'lim Journal*, 26(3), 243-253. doi:[10.15548/jt.v26i3.552](https://doi.org/10.15548/jt.v26i3.552)
- Harahap, S. (2015). *Islam & modernity: From modernization to upholding modern piety*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Hasbullah. (2015). *Educational policy: From the perspective of theory, application, and objective conditions of education in Indonesia*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Hashim, I. (2017). Key aspects of current educational reforms in Islamic educational schools. *Global Journal Al-Thaqafah*, 7(1), 49-57.
- Hogl, K., Kleinschmit, D., & Rayner, J. (2016). Achieving policy integration across fragmented policy domains: Forests, agriculture, climate, and energy. *Environment and Planning C: Government and Policy*, 34, 399-414. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177/0263774X16644815>
- Kasuga, W. (2019). The influence of politics in curriculum change and innovation in Tanzania. *European Journal of Education Studies*, 5(12), 22-45. doi:[10.5281/zenodo.2595954](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.2595954)
- Khan, A. R. (2016). Policy implementation: Some aspects and issues. *Journal of Community Positive Practices*, 16(3), 3-12.
- Khan, A. R., & Khandaker, S. (2016). A Critical Insight into Policy Implementation and implementation performance. *Public Policy and Administration*, 15(4), 538-548. doi:[DOI:10.13165/VPA-16-15-4-02](https://doi.org/10.13165/VPA-16-15-4-02)
- Kristanto, A. (2016). Educational technology applications in schools. *Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan*, 4(1), 13-16.
- Mahfud, C. (2019). Evaluation of Islamic education curriculum policy in Indonesia. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar dan Pembelajaran*, 9(1), 34-43. doi:[DOI:10.25273/pe.v9i1.4016](https://doi.org/10.25273/pe.v9i1.4016)
- Marume, S. B. (2016). Public Policy and Factors Influencing Public Policy. *International Journal of Engineering Science Invention*, 5(6), 06-14.
- Mawardi, A. (2016). Development of Islamic religious education curriculum in Indonesia. *Jurnal Tarbawi*, 1(1), 29-36.
- Miles, M., & Huberman, A. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A method sourcebook (3 ed.)*. (C. Rohidin, Trans.) Jakarta: UI Press.
- Muhaimin. (2009). *Development of curriculum models for education unit level in schools and madrasas*. Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo.
- Muhammedi. (2016). Curriculum changes in Indonesia: Critical study of efforts to find the ideal Islamic curriculum. *Raudhah*, 4(1), 49-70.
- Mulyasa, E. (2006). *Competency-based curriculum: Concepts, characteristics, and implementation*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Mulyasa, E. (2007). *Educational unit level curriculum: A practical guide*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Mumtahanah, L. (2020). Integration of multicultural values in the learning of Islamic religious education in elementary schools. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 3(1), 55-74. doi:<https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v3i1.461>
- Nata, A. (2010). *Islamic Education*. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Grup.
- Newig, J., & Koontz, T. M. (2014). Multi-level governance, policy implementation, and participation: the EU's mandated participatory planning approach to implementing environmental policy. *Journal of European Public Policy*, 21(2), 248-267. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/13501763.2013.834070>
- Nugroho, R. (2009). *Public Policy*. Jakarta : PT. Elex Media Komputindo.
- Nurhadi. (2019). Critical analysis of the concept of Indonesian Islamic education curriculum in schools (elementary, junior high, vocational). *eL BIDAYAH Journal of Islamic Elementary Education*, 1(1), 1-15. doi:[DOI:https://doi.org/10.33367/jiee.v1i1.671](https://doi.org/10.33367/jiee.v1i1.671)

- Pasiska, P. (2019). Islamic values education in the era of globalization. *Journal of Research and Thought on Islamic Education*, 2(1), 107-125. doi:<https://doi.org/10.24260/jrtie.v2i1.1233>
- Rahayu, Y. M. (2016). The effect of the 2013 curriculum changes on the development of students. *Jurnal Logika*, 18(3), 22-42.
- Ramayulis. (1994). *Islamic Education*. Jakarta: Kalam Mulia.
- Ramdhani, A., & Ramdhani, M. A. (2017). General concept of public policy. *Jurnal Publik*, 11(1), 1-12.
- Rifai, M. (2012). Competency-based curriculum (basic concepts and implementation). *Primary education and learning journal*, 2(1), 38-51. doi:DOI: <http://doi.org/10.25273/pe.v2i01.46>
- Ritonga, M. (2018). The politics and policy dynamics of the change in the education curriculum in Indonesia until the reform period. *Bina Gogik: Scientific journal of primary school education*, 5(2), 88-102.
- Rokhman, F., & Yuliati. (2010). The development of the Indonesian teaching material based on a multicultural context by using a sociolinguistic approach at junior high school. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 9, 1481-1488. doi:doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.12.353
- Sahlan, A. (2014). Enhancement of culture in education: research on Indonesian high school. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 143, 117-121. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.07.371>
- Said, M. M., Muhammad, N., & Elangkovan, K. (2014). The continuity and change of Indonesia's Islamic higher educational institutions in the amid of educational policy change. *Asian Social Science*, 10(6), 71-80. doi:doi:10.5539/ass.v10n6p71
- Said, M. M., Umachandran, K., & Don, A. G. (2018). Innovation in Islamic Education. *Indonesian Journal of Multidisciplinary Islamic Studies*, 2(2), 117-128. doi:DOI:<https://doi.org/10.21009/hayula.002.2.02>
- Salleh, M. S. (2013). strategizing Islamic education. *International Journal of Education and Research*, 1(6), 1-14.
- Salvesen, D., Evenson, K. R., Rodriguez, D. A., & Brown, A. (2008). Factors influencing implementation of local policies to promote physical activity: a case study of Montgomery County, Maryland. *Journal of Public Health Management Practice*, 14(3), 280-288.
- Schmidt, V. A. (2008). Discursive Institutionalism: The Explanatory Power of Ideas and Discourse. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 11, 303-326. doi:10.1146/annurev.polisci.11.060606.135342
- Sirozi, M. (2010). *Politics of Education*. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.
- Snyder, H. (2019). Literature review as a research methodology: An overview and guidelines. *Journal of Business Research*, 104, 333-339. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.07.039>
- Solichin, M. (2015). Implementation of educational policies and the role of the bureaucracy. *Religi Jurnal Studi Islam*, 6(2), 148-178.
- Srimulyani, E. (2013). Islamic schooling in aceh: change, reform, and local context. *Studia Islamika*, 20(3), 467-487.
- Steenbrink, K. A. (1986). *Boarding School Madrasas*. Jakarta: Dharma Aksara Perkasa.
- Subhan, A. (2012). *Indonesian Islamic educational institutions*. Jakarta: Kencana Predana Media Group.
- Sung, Y.-T., Chang, K.-E., & Liu, T.-C. (2016). The effects of integrating mobile devices with teaching and learning on students' learning performance: A meta-analysis and research synthesis. *Computers & Education*, 94, 252-275. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2015.11.008>
- Suparlan. (2011). *Question and answer on curriculum development and learning material*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.
- Sutomo, I. (2014). Modification of character education into akhlaq education for the global community life. *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, 4(2), 291-316.
- Suyoto. (1974). *Pesantren and renewal*. Bandung: Dekstop Publishing.
- Syafaruddin. (2008). *Effectiveness of education policy*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Syafaruddin. (2009). *Islamic education: Launch the regenerative potential of the people*. Jakarta: Hijri Pustaka Utama.
- Tanjung, M. (2012). *Maktab Islamiyah Tapanuli 1918-1942*. Medan: IAIN press.
- Tezera, D. (2019). Factors for the successful implementation of policies. *Merit Research Journals*, 7(8), 92-95. doi:10.5281/zenodo.3382780
- Tranfield, D., Denyer, D., & Smart, P. (2003). Towards a methodology for developing evidence-informed management knowledge employing the systematic review. *British Journal of Management*, 14, 207-222. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8551.00375>

- Ulu, E., & Kiraz, A. (2014). Science Education and Cognitive Development in the Updated 2012 Pre-School Curriculum. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 136, 438-451. doi:doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.05.354
- Utaminingsih, S., Utomo, S., & Zamroni, E. (2017). Strengthening the Indonesian Islamic character through Islamic education management based on soft skills. *ADDIN*, 11(1), 215-242.
- Vargas, V. R., Lawthom, R., Prowse, A., Randles, S., & Tzoulas, K. (2019). Implications of vertical policy integration for sustainable development implementation in higher education institutions. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 733-740.
- Wahyuni, S. (2016). Curriculum development in the Indonesian context the historical perspectives and the implementation. *Universum: The Islamic and culture journal*, 10(1), 73-82.
- Wardi, M. (2014). The problems of Islamic education and alternative solutions. *Tadris*, 8(1), 1-17.
- Wekke, I. S. (2015). Arabic Teaching and Learning: A Model From Indonesian Muslim Minority. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 191, 286-290. doi:doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.236
- Wekke, I. S., & Hamid, S. (2013). Technology on language teaching and learning: A research on Indonesian pesantren. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 83, 585-589. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.06.111
- Wekke, I., & Lubis, M. (2008). A Multicultural approach in Arabic language teaching: Creating equality at Indonesian pesantren classroom life. *Sociohumanika*, 1(2), 295-310.
- Widodo, M. S. (1974). *Islamic boarding school and renewal*. Jakarta: PT. Pustaka LP3ES Indonesia.
- Woodward, K. E. (2015). Indonesian schools: shaping the future of Islam and democracy in a democratic Muslim country. *Journal of International Education and Leadership*, 5(1), 1-23.
- Yasmadi. (2002). *Islamic boarding schools modernization*. Jakarta: Ciputat Press.
- Yulianti, K. (2015). The new curriculum implementation in Indonesia: a study in two primary schools. *International Journal about Parents in Education*, 9(1), 157-168.
- Yunus, M. (1992). *History of Islamic education*. Jakarta: Mutiara Sumber Wijaya.
- Zedan, A. M., Yusoff, M. Y., & Mohamed, R. B. (2015). An innovative teaching method in Islamic studies: The use of PowerPoint in the University of Malaya as a case study. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 182, 543-549.

doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.77
6